

heroic responses to what they perceive as a crisis in Catholic education, but they "appear to be tilting at windmills" (317). Appleby agrees when he notes that these colleges seem to be "preparing students for a world that no longer exists" (332).

Other offerings in this text include foci on interpreting Vatican II, relations between Americanism and Catholicism, laity response to faith and dissent, neoconservatives, antifeminists, Marianists, fellowships of Catholic scholars, and abortion activists.

The text includes a helpful epilogue by Appleby in which he attempts to simplify these conservative responses. Slightly reminiscent of H. Richard Niebuhr's scheme in *Christ and Culture*, Appleby classifies these voices as "world-renouncers" and "world-transformers." The renouncers reject Vatican II altogether and may go so far as to believe the church has been given over to Satan. The transformers are more inclined to adapt and adopt and are therefore more likely to be effective in advancing the conservative response in American Catholicism. The transformers are more able to engage the pluralism that is inherent in the American experiment. Appleby sees a bright future for many of these transformers. This is especially the case for the neoconservatives who typically hold powerful positions in the greater society.

For those readers not familiar with the various perspectives included in this volume, the authors include for each article a prologue that sets the stage for the essay that follows. Also helpful are appendices, one of which lists conservative Catholic publications in America.

The conservative offerings of this volume are sandwiched between the essays of the liberal editors. The introduction and epilogue both prepare and conclude for the reader how one should understand these conservatives. Neither of the editors attempts to hide this fact, however, and their goals of dialogue are worthy. Perhaps they could pass the role of editing the liberal voices of the upcoming volume to a couple of conservatives.

2590 Village Dr.
Waynesboro, VA 22980

MARK F. CARR

Wenham, David. *Paul, Follower of Jesus or Founder of Christianity?* Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1995. 452 pp. \$22.00.

This important book addresses from a biblical perspective the old question of the relationship between Paul and Jesus. Was Paul a faithful follower of Jesus or the founder of a new religion? The scholarly discussion on the thesis that Paul "invented" Christianity started at Tübingen with F. C. Baur and has reached ever since an always wider support. W. Wrede (1907), J. Klausner (1946), G. Vermes (1983), and H. Maccoby (1986) among others have argued that Paul turned the Jewish prophet Jesus into a gentile God and made Christianity what it is now.

The author introduces the subject by recalling the historical data of the controversy on those two basic questions: (a) "Is Paul dependent on the teachings and traditions of Jesus, directly or indirectly?" and (b) "Is Paul's theological understanding and emphasis similar or dissimilar to that of Jesus?" (1-33).

The main part of the book is dedicated to a detailed analysis in which the author compares and connects the teachings of Jesus and Paul on the following

points: the kingdom of God, the identity of Jesus, the theological meaning of the crucifixion, the mission of the church, ethics, and eschatology (34-337). This analysis is completed by a survey of Paul's knowledge of Jesus' life and ministry (338-372), and a final chapter summarizing the author's conclusion on the relationship of Paul and Jesus (373-410), with an additional note on the form of Paul's gospel (411).

The evidence assembled on the continuity between Paul and Jesus is impressive, although not equally strong for every point. However, the author succeeds in proving that despite the differences of circumstances and vocabulary, the teachings of Jesus and Paul are remarkably similar. Many examples are quite conclusive regarding Paul's dependence on Jesus, e.g., the story of the last supper (1 Cor 11), the resurrection narratives (1 Cor 15:3-5), the teachings on divorce (1 Cor 7:10-11), the teachings about preachers being paid for their work (1 Cor 9:14; Mt 10:10; Lk 10:7), "a word from the Lord" on the second coming (1 Thess 4:15), and the statement "I know and am persuaded in the Lord that nothing is unclean" (Rom 14:4 in relationship with Mk 7).

The arguments for Paul's avoidance of kingdom language, although less conclusive, are particularly interesting. It seems quite reasonable to accept that Paul's teaching on righteousness is parallel to Jesus' teaching on the kingdom of God, and that Paul seldom used the term because he wanted "to avoid the potential political overtones of kingdom language" (79).

Most of the other assumed connections are equally attractive but remain still hypothetical: namely the relationship between the story of Jesus' temptations and Paul's doctrine of Jesus' sinfulness, the allusions to the beatitudes of the sermon on the mount, the connection between the references to the "son of man" and the teachings on the new Adam, the reminiscences to the parable of the prodigal son, or to the account of the ascension, etc. (385). However, the aim of the author is certainly reached in proving that "Paul saw himself as the slave of Jesus Christ, not the founder of Christianity, and that he was right to see himself in that way" (410). One important question still remains unanswered: if Paul depends so much on the teachings of Jesus, why does he so seldom refer to Jesus' life and ministry?

Since the book attempts to address both scholars and a wider audience (xiv), the technical comparison of texts often seems a little lengthy for the general readers and somehow superficial for the specialists. In any case, this work constitutes the most extensive treatment of this subject thus far and the best comprehensive contribution to the discussion on the relationship between Paul and Jesus. It will certainly need to be taken into consideration in further research.

Faculté Adventiste de Théologie
Collonges-sous-Salève, France

ROBERTO BADENAS

Wolfers, David. *Deep Things Out of Darkness: The Book of Job: Essays and a New English Translation*. Kampen, Netherlands: Pharos; Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1995. 552 pp. \$35.00.

David Wolfers, M.D., dedicated the last twenty years of his life to the study of the book of Job. His magnum opus, *Deep Things Out of Darkness*, the result of this dedication, makes a bold statement indeed. Its title, from Job 12:22, quoting